



PARTICIPATION MANAGEMENT PRACTICES EFFECT ON COMMITMENT: THE SAMPLE OF IRAQ ELECTRICITY INDUSTRY

Samer Hammad Assi , Asst. Prof. Dr. Emine Şener , Prof. Dr. Musa Özata ,
KIRŞEHİR AHI EVRAN UNIVERSITY / SOSYAL BİLİMLER ENSTİTÜSÜ / İŞLETME ANABİLİM DALI
Samerlovwe7788@gmail.com

Article history:	Abstract:
Received: November 12 th 2022 Accepted: December 8 th 2022 Published: January 11 th 2023	<p>In this study, the effect of participative management practices on organisational commitment in the Iraqi electricity sector is examined. The population of the research, which is within the scope of relational screening model, is the employees of the electricity sector in Iraq. The study group of the research consists of 145 people who can be reached among the employees working in electricity production and electricity distribution companies in Baghdad Province of Iraq. The data of the research were obtained by questionnaire method. In this direction, Iraqi Electricity Sector Employee Questionnaire, Employee General Information Questionnaire, Participative Management Scale and Organisational Commitment Scale were applied to the participants and the data obtained were analysed with SPSS statistical package programme. At the end of the study, the following findings were obtained. organisational commitment scale showed differences according to sociodemographic data. Emotional commitment sub-dimension differs according to sociodemographic data. Continuance commitment sub-dimension differed according to sociodemographic data. normative commitment sub-dimension differed according to sociodemographic data. C2 scale differs according to sociodemographic data. C3 scale differs according to sociodemographic data. Positive aspects and advantages of Iraqi electricity sector differ according to sociodemographic data. The negative aspects and disadvantages of the Iraqi electricity sector differ according to sociodemographic data.</p>

Keywords: Management, Participatory Management, Organizational Commitment, Iraq

INTRODUCTION

Today, all organizations basically aim to achieve success in the fields in which they operate. In order to achieve this, organizations need skilled and experienced human resources as well as having all the necessary knowledge and technological infrastructure. Organizations with strong human resources are more likely to survive than others. Organizations should attach great importance to employee motivation in order to use their human resources in the most efficient way. Because motivated human resources add dynamism to organizations and make them more efficient (Gökalp, 2018). Since the second half of the 20th century, with the understanding of the importance of human resources in management, the idea that the human factor should be evaluated in the best way has begun to develop. According to this idea, which has become a general expression of the modern management approach, people's use of their

knowledge, skills and abilities more increases their contribution to the institution they belong to. In this context, one of the most frequently used methods is the participation of employees in management (Yaman, 2010). In management literature, participation is the realization of participation in decision-making processes by taking into account the opinions of the governed. The essence of participation is that the governed can have an idea about the events and situations that require decision making. However, participation includes not only the idea that employees can have an opinion, but also the idea that they can shape a solution and help find realistic solutions to problems (Ulutaş, 2011). Therefore, participatory management foresees the democratic management of enterprises and expresses the participation of employees in some decisions taken within the enterprise at different levels. Participatory management allows employees to take a



role in influencing the quality and quality of decisions by being directly involved in the organizational and institutional decision-making process. Employees have a legitimate control effect within the organization through participatory management practices (Tannenbaum, 1968). With the participatory management approach, it is aimed that the employees who do not own the workplace are motivated by feeling that they take responsibility and have responsibility in the management of the business (Başar, 2017). Employees who think they have a say in the conduct of the business, take responsibility and are more motivated, greatly influence employers, decision makers, management staff, in short, all stakeholders and parties in the sector. In a study conducted in this direction, it was determined that participatory management positively affects the relationship between employee participation and job satisfaction (Smith & Brannick, 1990). In another study, it was found that participatory management positively affects the improvement of productivity and increases organizational performance (Gowen et al., 1991). In a study conducted by Voos (1989), it was determined that there was a negative relationship between participatory management and absenteeism, and that participatory management reduced absenteeism. Başar (2017) states that participatory management affects job satisfaction. One of the biggest effects of participatory management practices is on organizational commitment. Organizational commitment is that employees share the instructions of the managers and fulfill the given instructions in a more motivated way (Daft, 1994). In other words, organizational commitment is the act of employees staying loyal to the values of the organization (Clayton, 2000).

REVIEW OF LITERATURE

The people who take the decision and the people who implement the decision are usually people in different positions and who have a parent-child relationship between them. While managers make decisions, employees execute this decision. Therefore, the inclusion of employees in the decision-making process leads to more effective and more functional work of the employees who implement the decision. This reconciliation between the employee and the manager undoubtedly has a positive effect on the organizational commitment of the employees. Accordingly, creating a business participation or exchange platform in organizations at any level will ensure that decisions are taken in a healthier way and will facilitate the implementation and compliance of the decisions taken.

The employee, whose opinion is asked about a decision subject to implementation or whose suggestion is directly converted into a decision, will respond to these decisions more sincerely and ensure their implementation. Since the business trusts and values its employees, the employee will develop emotional bonds to the workplace and will begin to show a higher level of commitment (Ulutaş, 2011). This situation reveals that participatory management approach is an important structure that is effective on organizational commitment. In this study, the effect of participatory management practices on organizational commitment is examined in the example of the Iraqi electricity sector.

Indeed, when we look at the literature, the study of Allen et al. in 1997 focuses on the role of gender in participatory management and the tendency of employees to "self-selection" in the same study (Allen et al., 1997). In a study conducted by Perotin and Robinson in 2000, the productivity predictor is emphasized and the relationship between participatory management and employee productivity is emphasized (Perotin and Robinson, 2000). The relationship of participatory management with the predictor of trust in employees was also discussed by Sojka in 1999 (Sojka, 1999). In addition, in an earlier period 1993, Noe and Wilk discussed the relationship between learning attitude and the need for self-development, and the perceptions about these with participatory management (Noe & Wilk, 1993).

The work in the second group mostly focuses on the interaction of the employees with the institution and the organization. In this context, while Rooney questioned the relationship between participatory management and job satisfaction in the study he published in 1987 (Rooney, 1987), Mayer and Schoorman in 1992, Hodson et al. in 1994, and Tetrick et al. it is seen that the relationship between organizational commitment is discussed (Tetrick et al., 2007). A study questioning the quality and sustainability of working life was published by Dawkins and Frass in 2005 (Dawkins and Frass, 2005). When we look at the studies carried out in the previous periods, studies that can be evaluated in this group stand out. One of them is a study published by Gowen et al. in 1991 examining the relationship between participatory management and improving productivity. (Gowen et al., 1991), and the other one is the study published by Voos in 1989 and evaluated the relationship between participatory management and absenteeism (Voos, 1989). It is observed that the studies in the third group mostly focus on the results



of participatory management. Accordingly, in the study conducted by Smith and Brannick in 1990, it was determined that participatory management had a positive effect on the relationship between employee participation and job satisfaction (Smith and Brannick, 1990), while in the study conducted by Graham and Verma in 1991, (civil virtue) was and contextual discontent are situational factors that affect the strength of the relationship between employee involvement and tenure, and employee involvement and emotion (Graham & Verma, 1991)

3. METHOD

3.1 Participants

The universe of the research is Electricity Sector Employees in Iraq. However, due to the temporal and spatial difficulties and impossibilities in reaching the universe, it is considered appropriate to choose a sample to represent the universe. This sample is the study group. The working group is planned to reach 145 people among the employees of the electricity generation and electricity distribution companies located in the Baghdad Province of Iraq.

3.2 Instrument

Within the scope of the study, various surveys and scale applications will be carried out with the electricity sector employees who make up the working group, if possible, face-to-face, if possible, in an electronic/online environment within the scope of Covid-19 measures. These questionnaires and scales are: Iraq Electricity Sector Employee Questionnaire, Employee General Knowledge Questionnaire, Participant Management Scale, and Organizational Commitment Scale.

3.3 Procedures

we need to examine whether our data is consistent and reliable with each other. We use Reliability Analysis for this (Kalaycı, 2008:405). In order to determine whether the answers given to the questions in the scales show a homogeneous structure, the data were analyzed with the help of SPSS 16.00 package program. Our scale reliability (Cronbach's Alpha) value was found to be 86.4%. This means our scales are highly reliable. There is no need to remove any questions from our scale.

Result and Discussion .4

According to the study findings; organizational commitment scale differed according to sociodemographic data. In order to discuss the findings obtained, literature reviews were conducted. In a study conducted by Serinikli (2016) to determine whether organizational commitment levels differ according to demographic characteristics, it was also shown that employees' organizational commitment levels are high. Again, in the study conducted by Mercan (2019), it was thought that there may be differences in the level of organizational commitment according to sociodemographic variables. In the study conducted by Sarıköse et al. (2020), a significant difference was found between the organizational commitment levels of some socio-demographic characteristics of nurses. In addition, in the study of Çarıkçı and Küçükeşmen (2017), it was revealed that organizational commitment is shaped according to the demographic characteristics of individuals. In this sense, it can be stated that the findings of the study are supported by the literature.

.Table 1Frequency Distribution Table for Sociodemographic Data

Questions	Variable Categories	N	%
Age	18-23	25	17,2
	24-29	13	9,0
	30-34	20	13,8
	35-39	16	11,0
	40-44	21	14,5
	45-49	19	13,1
	50-54	13	9,0
	55 and more	18	12,4
Education status	High school	59	40,7
	Bachelor's degree	38	26,2
	Master's degree	28	19,3



	Doctorate	20	13,8
Gender	Woman	75	51,7
	Male	70	48,3

.Table 2Organizational Commitment Scale Frequency Distribution Table

Organizational Commitment Scale Frequency Distributions										
QUESTIONS	I strongly disagree		I disagree		Neutral		I agree		I strongly agree	
	N	%	N	%	N	%	N	%	N	%
1. I would be very happy to spend the rest of my professional life in this school.	4	2,8	13	9	15	10,3	97	66,9	16	11
2. I really see the problems of this school as my own problems.	2	1,4	21	14,5	13	9	98	67,6	11	7,6
3. I do not feel a strong belonging to my school.	11	7,6	99	68,3	16	11	17	11,7	2	1,4
4. I do not feel emotional attachment to this school.	12	8,3	96	66,2	10	6,9	24	16,6	3	2,1
5. At this school, I don't see myself as "part of the family" .	14	9,7	103	71	7	4,8	21	14,5	0	0
6. This school has a very special place for me.	3	2,1	13	9	14	9,7	107	73,8	8	5,5
7. The fact that I am currently working in this school is both from my own will and because the conditions require it.	2	1,4	14	9,7	8	5,5	112	77,2	9	6,2
8. Even if I wanted to leave my school, it would be very difficult for me right now.	1	0,7	11	7,6	11	7,6	105	72,4	17	11,7
9. If I were to leave my school right now, many things in my life would be turned upside down.	1	0,7	9	6,2	15	10,3	106	73,1	14	9,7
10. There are very few options that will make me think of leaving this school.	3	2,1	10	6,9	13	9	107	73,8	12	8,3
11. If I hadn't added so much of myself to this school, I might have thought of working	1	0,7	12	8,3	17	11,7	108	74,5	7	4,8



elsewhere.										
12. If I were to leave this school, one of the negative results would be the scarcity of suitable alternatives.	2	1,4	12	8,3	13	9	108	74,5	10	6,9
13. I don't feel a debt of gratitude/responsibility to my managers for continuing to work at this school.	4	2,8	17	11,7	10	6,9	104	71,7	10	6,9
14. Even if leaving this school is for my benefit, I think it is not right to leave this school right now.	7	4,8	101	69,7	16	11	20	13,8	1	0,7
15. If I were to leave my school right now, I would feel guilty.	7	4,8	110	75,9	9	6,2	15	10,3	4	2,8
16. This school deserves my (devotion)	14	9,7	104	71,7	11	7,6	16	11	0	0
17. I am not leaving this school right now because I feel a grateful obligation/responsibility towards the people in this school.	13	9	97	66,9	15	10,3	20	13,8	0	0
18. I owe a lot to this school.	11	7,6	102	70,3	17	11,7	14	9,7	1	0,7

In addition, organizational commitment was examined in terms of affective, continuance and normative commitment sub-dimensions. As it is known, Emotional commitment refers to identifying with the organization, being interested in it and being emotionally attached to it. Thus, employees with strong emotional commitment stay in the organization because they want to stay as it is seen in table 2. Continuance commitment refers to the commitment based on the employee's recognition of the costs associated with leaving the organization. Employees with strong continuance commitment stay because they have to stay in the organization. Those who work in normative commitment, which is the last type of commitment, have a sense of obligation towards the organization. Employees with strong normative commitment stay

because they think they should do it (Kaluç, Kırılmaz, & Kırılmaz, 2021). It can be stated that the findings are in parallel with the literature.

It was desired to examine whether the Organizational Commitment Scale differs according to age, educational status and gender. Organizational Commitment Scale did not differ according to age and educational status. Organizational Commitment Scale did not differ according to gender. When the literature was examined, similar results were found in the study conducted by Kaluç, Kırılmaz, and Kırılmaz, (2021). In addition, in the study conducted by Kılıçaslan and Marşap, no difference was found in (2018) employees' HR perceptions according to age, gender and educational status. Pai et al., (2012) concluded in their study that there is no difference between professional



commitment and gender factor. In this sense, it can be said that the findings of the study are supported by the literature.

It was aimed to examine whether the Emotional Commitment Sub-Dimension differs according to age, educational status and gender. Emotional Commitment Sub-Dimension did not differ according to age, gender and educational status. In the study conducted by Acar and Türkoğlu (2017), there was no significant difference between genders in the dimensions of Emotional Commitment. Again, in the study conducted by Ataç (2019), no significant difference was found between teachers' emotional commitment and gender and age. In the study conducted by Taş (2012), nurses' organizational commitment scale scores in terms of gender and emotional commitment scores, which are sub-dimensions of organizational commitment, were compared with the t-test and no significant difference was found. In this sense, it can be stated that the findings of the study are in parallel with the literature.

It was desired to examine whether the Continuance Commitment Sub-Dimension differs according to age, education level, and gender. When examining whether the sub-dimension of continuance commitment differs according to age and education level, the variable did not differ. According to the results of the analysis made by Ak and Sezer, (2018); Continuance commitment did not differ significantly according to age. When the continuance commitment sub-dimension was examined according to gender, this variable did not differ. In the study conducted by Acar and Türkoğlu (2017), there was no significant difference between genders in continuance commitment, according to the Kruskal-Wallis test conducted for Emotional Commitment Continuance Commitment. In the study conducted by Taş (2012), nurses' organizational commitment scale scores in terms of gender and their continuance scores, which are sub-dimensions of organizational commitment, were compared with the t-test and no significant difference was found. Durna and Eren (2005) aimed to determine the organizational commitment of

employees in the field of education and health in Niğde province by comparing them with various demographic factors. According to the results of the research, it has been determined that there is no relationship between continuance commitment and the age of the employees. In the study conducted by Meyer and Allen (1984), it was revealed that age was not associated with continuance commitment, which is one of the sub-dimensions of commitment. In some studies using the Allen and Meyer model, a low correlation was found between age and emotional commitment (Şimşek, 2013). It can be stated that the findings show parallelism with the literature.

It was desired to examine whether the Normative Commitment Sub-Dimension differs according to age, education level and gender. When the Normative Commitment Sub-Dimension differs according to age and education level, this variable did not differ. In some studies using the Allen and Meyer model, a low correlation was found between age and normative commitment (Şimşek, 2013). When the Normative Commitment Sub-Dimension was examined by gender, this variable did not show any difference. In the study conducted by Acar and Türkoğlu (2017), there is no significant difference between genders in terms of Normative Commitment dimensions. In the study conducted by Taş (2012), nurses' organizational commitment scale scores in terms of gender and normative commitment scores, which are sub-dimensions of organizational commitment, were compared with the t-test and no significant difference was found. In this sense, it can be said that the findings of the study are supported by the literature.

It was desired to examine whether the C2 Scale differs according to age, education level and gender. When examining whether the C2 Scale differs according to age and education level, it was seen that the test statistic p value of this variable was greater than 0.05. The C2 Scale did not differ according to age and educational status. When the C2 Scale changes according to gender, it is seen that the test statistic p value of this variable is greater than 0.025. The C2 Scale did not differ by gender as seen in the table 3.

Table 3. C2 Scale Frequency Distribution Table

C2 Scale Frequency Distributions											
Decisions are taken with the participation of all employees of the institution.	22	15,2	111	76,6	3	2,1	8	5,5	1	0,7	



Employees are given freedom in terms of their working style.	21	14,5	106	73,1	12	8,3	6	4,1	0	0
Employees and their work are valued and accepted as the basis of work.	18	12,4	106	73,1	11	7,6	10	6,9	0	0
Employees' feedback is requested about changes in activities.	21	14,5	105	72,4	10	6,9	9	6,2	0	0
Employees are given the freedom to choose the best way to achieve the goals set by the management.	19	13,1	103	71,0	12	8,3	11	7,6	0	0
Suggestions are requested from employees in urgent problems.	15	10,3	107	73,8	14	9,7	8	5,5	1	0,7

It was desired to examine whether the C3 Scale differs according to age, education level and gender. When examining whether the C3 Scale differs according to age and education level, it was seen that the test statistic p value of this variable was greater than 0.05. The C3 Scale did not differ according to age and

educational status. When the C3 Scale changed according to gender, it was observed that the test statistic p value of this variable was greater than 0.025. The C3 Scale did not differ by gender as seen in table 4.

.Table 4C3 Scale Frequency Distribution Table

C3 Scale Frequency Distribution										
Employees work as a team under participatory management, complementing each other to achieve success.	23	15,9	112	77,2	5	3,4	5	3,4	0	0
There is always an environment of mutual love and respect between employees and managers in the institution.	18	12,4	107	73,8	12	8,3	8	5,5	0	0



Employees tend to stick to their work schedules and perform required tasks.	18	12,4	104	71,7	14	9,7	9	6,2	0	0
Employees work out of love, not out of necessity.	15	10,3	107	73,8	10	6,9	11	7,6	2	1,4
In any emergency personnel are ready to work overtime.	20	13,8	107	73,8	8	5,5	9	6,2	1	0,7

In order to compare the findings obtained from the C2 and C3 scales with the literature, the necessary literature was searched, but similar findings could not be found. In this sense, it is thought that it will form the basis for possible future studies and researches.

When the positive and negative aspects and advantages of the participants in the Iraqi Electricity Sector are compared whether their opinions differ according to age, education level and gender, it is seen that the test statistics p values are greater than 0.05. It did not show the positive aspects and advantages of the participants in the Iraqi Electricity Sector. It did not differ according to the sociodemographic data such as age, education level and gender. In order to compare the findings with the literature, the necessary literature was searched, but similar findings could not be found. In this sense, it is thought that it will be the basis for future studies and researches.

CONCLUSION

Organizational commitment is studied as one of the most important factors for the effectiveness of an organization. Commitment is examined as the psychological attachment of an employee to the organization in which he is employed. It is seen as one of the main factors that trigger productivity and low turnover intention in the workplace. Organizations that can keep their employees' commitment levels high can retain their employees for a longer period of time and manage crisis situations. There are various factors that have been researched to affect the organizational commitment of employees. Participatory management has been examined as a factor that causes organizational commitment in employees. Participatory management is a concept that advocates the

participation of employees in organizational tasks such as decision making and operations. Participatory management demands that organizational leadership not try to keep their employees on a short leash, but instead allow them to innovate in the organization. Employee priorities, managerial attitudes and training consistency are some of the dimensions of participatory management. When there is a participatory management style in the organization, the employees of that organization are encouraged to be involved in the organizational decision-making processes. Organizational commitment can be achieved through the participation of employees.

The main purpose of this study is to determine the effects of participatory management practices on the organizational commitment levels of the Iraqi Electricity Sector employees. This study also aims to test the mediating effect of employee participation in the relationship between participatory management and organizational commitment. The results of this study will help managers understand how participatory management practices can enable them to develop organizational commitment among their employees through employee involvement. The findings of this study will help managers to reduce turnover rates in their organizations and increase employee productivity.

References

1. Acar, O. K., & Türkoğlu, Ç. (2017). Kamuda işletmecilik eksenli değişimle birlikte çalışanlarda örgütsel bağlılık ve iş tatmini düzeyleri: PTT üzerine bir alan araştırması. Karamanoğlu Mehmetbey Üniversitesi Sosyal ve Ekonomik Araştırmalar Dergisi, 19(33), 93-102.
2. Ak, M., & Sezer, Ö. (2018). Kamu Sektöründe



- Örgütsel Bağlılık: 11 10 2011 Tarih ve 663 Sayılı KHK Kapsamında Yapılandırılan Kamu Sağlık Sektöründe Örgütsel Bağlılığın Analizi. *Social Sciences Studies Journal*, 4(18), 1709-1723.
3. Allen, N. J., & Meyer, J. P. (1990). The measurement and antecedents of affective, continuance and normative commitment to the organization. *Journal of Occupational Psychology*, 63(1), 1-18.
 4. Ataç, İ. (2019). Öğretmenlerin Denetim Odakları İle Mesleki Bağlılıkları Arasındaki İlişki. (Yüksek Lisans Tezi). İstanbul Sabahattin Zaim Üniversitesi Sosyal Bilimler Enstitüsü Eğitim Bilimleri Anabilim Dalı.
 5. Başar, P. (2017). Katılımcı yönetimin iş doyumuna üzerine etkisi: akademik personel üzerinde bir araştırma. *Ekonomi İşletme Siyaset ve Uluslararası İlişkiler Dergisi*, 3(1), 1-34.
 6. Clayton, S. (2000). Yönetim (Sharpen your team's skills in supervision). Çev. Mehmet Zaman, Hayat Yayıncılık, İstanbul.
 7. Daft, R.,L. (1994). *Management, Third Ed., The Dryden Press.*
 8. Durna, U. ve Eren,V. (2005). Üç Bağlılık Unsuru Ekseninde Örgütsel Bağlılık, *Doğuş Üniversitesi Dergisi*, 6 (2), 210-219.
 9. Gowen III, C. R., & Jennings, S. A. (1991). The Effects of Changes in Participation and Group Size of Gainsharing Success: A Case Study. *Journal of Organizational Behavior Management*, 11(2), 147-170.
 10. Gökalp, S. A. (2018). Katılımcı Yönetim Anlayışı ve İLKSAN. *Türkiye Siyaset Bilimi Dergisi*, 1(2), 67-86.
 11. KALAYCI, C. (2008). Elektronik ticaret ve kobi'lere etkileri. *Uluslararası İktisadi ve İdari İncelemeler Dergisi*, (1).
 12. Kaluç, S., Kırılmaz, S. K., & Kırılmaz, H. (2021). Stratejik İnsan Kaynakları Yönetimi Uygulamalarının Örgütsel Bağlılığa Etkisi: Sağlık Çalışanları Üzerinde Bir Araştırma. *Turkish Studies-Social Sciences*, 16(3), 1057-1079.
 13. Meyer, J. P. and Allen, N. J., (1984), "Testing the 'Side-Bet Theory' of Organizational Commitment: Some Methodological Considerations", *Journal of Applied Psychology*, 69(3): 372-378.
 14. Pai, F.-Y., Yeh, T.-M. & Huang, K.-I. (2012). Professional Commitment of Information Technology Employees Under Depression Environments. *International Journal of Electronic Business Management*, 10(1): 17-29.
 15. Porter, L. W., Steers, R. M., Mowday, R. T., & Boulian, P. V. (1974). Organizational commitment, job satisfaction, and turnover among psychiatric technicians. *Journal of Applied Psychology*, 59(5), 603-609.
 16. Smith, C. S., & Brannick, M. T. (1990). A role and expectancy model of participative decision-making: A replication and theoretical extension. *Journal of Organizational Behavior*, 11(2), 91-104.
 17. Sojka, R. E., & Upchurch, D. R. (1999). Reservations regarding the soil quality concept. *Soil Science Society of America Journal*, 63, 1039-1054.
 18. Şimşek, B. (2013). Örgütsel Bağlılığı Etkileyen Faktörler Ve Tekstil Sektöründe Bir Araştırma. (Yüksek Lisans Tezi). İstanbul Kültür Üniversitesi Sosyal Bilimleri Enstitüsü.
 19. Tannenbaum, A. S. (1968). Control in organizations. Tata McGral-Hill Publishing Co.Ltd.
 20. Taş, Ö. (2012). Örgütsel Bağlılık, Örgütsel Güven Ve İş Doyumu Arasındaki İlişki: Özel Bir Hastane Örneği. (Yüksek Lisans Tezi). Ankara Üniversitesi Sağlık Bilimleri Enstitüsü.
 21. Ulutaş, M. (2011). Katılımcı Yönetimin Örgütsel Bağlılık ve Yaratıcılığa Etkisi: İmalat Sektöründe Bir Uygulama. *Sosyal Ekonomik Araştırmalar Dergisi*, 11(21), 593-615.
 22. Ulutaş, M., (2003). Katılımcı Yönetimin Örgütsel Bağlılık ve Yaratıcılığa Etkisi. (Yayımlanmamış Yüksek Lisans Tezi), Selçuk Üniversitesi Sosyal Bilimler Enstitüsü, Konya.
 23. Voos, P. B. (1989). The influence of cooperative programs on union-management relations, flexibility, and other labor relations outcomes. *Journal of Labor Research*, 10(1), 103-117.
 24. Yaman, F.T. (2010). Belediyelerde Çalışanların Yönetime Katılımı (İstanbul Büyükşehir Belediyesi Örneği), Doktora Tezi, Marmara Üniversitesi Sosyal Bilimler Enstitüsü.