



# THE ROLE OF THE INTERNAL AUDITOR IN APPLYING FINANCIAL PERFORMANCE INDICATORS TO IMPROVE BANKING PERFORMANCE APPLIED RESEARCH: IN (MIDDLE EAST BANK, ASHUR INTERNATIONAL BANK, KHALEEJI COMMERCIAL BANK)

Fadil Hussein Abbas

Applied research: in

(Middle East Bank, Ashur International Bank, Khaleeji Commercial Bank)

University of Thi-Qar.

Fadil.hussen1972@gmail.com

Article history:	Abstract:
<b>Received:</b> 20 <sup>th</sup> August 2022	The research aims to provide an introductory framework for the internal auditor in applying the banking financial performance indicators to the research sample, measuring the banking financial performance indicators to determining the strengths and weaknesses in the banking performance. By addressing the main research problem that revolves around the following questions :Does the internal auditor apply the banking financial performance indicators to the research sample? Does the application of banking performance indicators have an impact on improving banking performance? The research reached the most important conclusions Ashur International Bank outperforms in the rate of return on assets (ROA), which gives it an advantage over the Gulf Commercial Bank and the Middle East Bank in achieving net profits from asset investments. The Ashur International Bank also outperformed the rate of return on equity (ROE), which gives it preference over Khaleeji Commercial Bank and the Middle East Bank in the efficiency of management in exploiting the bank's own money and the ability of this money to generate profit. Among the most important recommendations are The necessity for the Gulf Commercial Bank and the Middle East Bank to enhance the rate of return on assets (ROA), by realizing net profits from investments in current assets. And the necessity for the Gulf Commercial Bank and the Middle East Bank to enhance the rate of return on equity (ROE) by exploiting the bank's own money and the ability of this money to generate profit.
<b>Accepted:</b> 20 <sup>th</sup> September 2022	
<b>Published:</b> 26 <sup>th</sup> October 2022	

**Keywords:** Internal auditor. financial performance. Indicators banking performance.

## INTRODUCTION

Banks have an important and vital role in all countries of the world, as they are the basis of the modern economic system, as banks in

general seek to bring about changes in their banking financial performance and policies to ensure their transition from the current level to a better level in the future .In order to achieve



this, the banking financial performance must be improved by activating the internal auditing devices, which consist of a group of auditors who have scientific and practical experience in the accounting field, in addition to other fields. Providing advisory services that help the administration reach the right decisions, so the internal audit operations are internal, control tool to detect deviations, imbalances and gaps that occur during the implementation of the planned goals, TO the commercial bank to perform a good financial banking performance, it must practice Internal auditing properly at its various organizational levels

**First: Research Methodology:**

• **Research problem: The research problem includes a set of questions, represented by the following:**

1. Does Internal auditor in unrein the application of performance indicators financial banking for sample search?
- 2- Does the application of banking performance indicators have an impact on improving banking performance?

• **Research Objectives: The research seeks to:**

- 1- Providing an introductory framework for the internal auditor in applying the banking financial performance indicators to the research sample
  - 2- Measuring the indicators of banking financial performance on the research sample and determining the strengths and weaknesses in the banking performance.
- The importance of the research: The research derives its importance from the role of the internal auditor in applying the banking financial performance indicators to the research sample and identifying the strengths and weaknesses to improve banking performance.
  - Research hypothesis: The research is based on the hypothesis that (the internal auditor has a role in applying the indicators of banking financial performance to the research sample and identifying strengths and weaknesses in banking performance).

Spatial limits for research: (Middle East Bank, Ashur International Bank, Khaleeji Commercial Bank)

Research time limits: from 2017 to 2020.

**Second: the definitional framework for the research variables**

First, the internal auditor:

Definition of Internal Audit: Internal audit is an "activity Advisor And that the internal audit process is carried out by a device within the economic unit and its employees are employees of the department who carry out its orders and practice the audit process mainly for raising the adequacy of performance, avoiding error and fraud, and limiting and preventing waste. (Hanan Abdulameer Kadhim, 2020) The internal audit activity must evaluate the processes of governance, risk management and control, from By following a systematic approach, in the field of governance, and propose appropriate recommendations for improvement. (Waad Hadi Abd, 2019) The institution's internal system aims to maintain effective control procedures and controls by evaluating their effectiveness and efficiency and promoting continuous improvement in them. The internal audit, which is represented by sure From the extent of the integrity and strength of the internal control systems and the validity of the data in the records and books, the internal auditor relies on the method of mathematical examination to achieve its goal of ensuring the implementation of administrative policies in the economic unit and indicating any deviation in it The internal auditor exercises his work within the scope of a detailed audit of all financial transactions. (Fadil Hussein Abbas, 2020) Based on this, it can be said that the internal auditor is responsible for discovering errors and fraud. As for embezzlement, we find that the tragic aspect of the work of the internal auditor is the examination required in cases of embezzlement or suspicion of embezzlement and in light of the complex tasks of projects. (Waad Hadi Abd D. A., 2022) Everyone who works in it must be trusted, not the other way around. The human soul can sometimes be exposed to situations in which its weakness appears towards situations that are tempting. and weaknesses, and these are what the internal auditor should look for, so he must make sure that there are no circumstances that allow manipulation for the purpose of



embezzlement. To show vulnerabilities in existing systems.

2: Services provided by the internal auditor:

- **Preventive services:**

These services are represented in a set of procedures set by the internal auditor in economic units to achieve protection of assets and property from theft, embezzlement or waste (extravagance) and to protect the various policies (administrative, financial and productivity) from unjustified distortion. Eliminate waste by maximizing the efficiency of productivity possible.

- **Assurance Services:**

These services are represented in the methods and procedures used by the internal auditor in the field of evaluating the effectiveness of the applied internal control systems and procedures and evaluating performance by verifying that the unit obtains its resources in an economical manner, as well as determining the extent of effectiveness in achieving the unit's objectives. Monitoring plans, following up on their implementation, identifying the goals they have achieved, and studying the reasons that prevented from reaching the set goals.

- **consulting services** :They are customer service activities, which are what is agreed upon with the customer in terms of the nature and scope of the subject matter of the audit for the purpose of adding value and improving the company's operations, such as advice, facilitation, process design and training. They represent (assurance services), either the design support service for these systems to provide specific recommendations representing advisory services) and internal audit can contribute to effective institutional control of the following works:

1. Assist in the analysis and confirmation of risk factors.
2. Work on analyzes of results and provide guarantees and assurances.
3. Assist management in giving preference to risk management and control systems.

- **Therapeutic services:**

They are the methods and procedures that the auditor uses in the field of correcting errors that he may discover or the recommendations contained in his report fix Any errors or

treatment of deficiencies in the various services provided by the auditor or in which he contributes. Reducing the risk of monitoring due to the difficulty of estimating the effects of the monitoring process on the client or the facility.

### 3: TYPES OF INTERNAL AUDIT:

Internal audit is divided into the following:

- **Compliance Audit** :It is the audit process that aims to verify the extent of compliance with the applicable laws and regulations and the procedures established by the unit, and it is the responsibility of the internal audit to ensure the application and control of the commitment of the various departments to the application of the internal system in their departments. (Kareem, 2022)

- **Financial audit:**

An audit of the financial statements is the auditor's gathering of evidence to verify that the financial statements in the institution are subject to audit, prepared and disclosed in accordance with previously defined standards, such as international or American accounting standards, to ensure that the financial statements do not include material errors or other errors that affect taking various economic decisions. (Bird, 2011)

- **performance audit:** The performance audit The audit process that leads to judgment about the efficiency and effectiveness of performance in the institution in general, by submitting reports to the management of the institution according to the available information on the performance of activities and standards in the budgets, plans and objectives previously drawn up. (Bemelmans, 2017)

Second: Banking financial performance indicators:

1. The concept of banking financial performance:

The banking financial performance from the perspective of commercial banks is specific goals and objectives and measures directed to achieve those goals and objectives, and they refer to the volume, return on capital employed, the level of operating income, the growth of cash flows, and net profit to sales. All these measures are directly related to the final results of banking performance. Bank



financial performance is also one of the most widely used and ancient fields of performance to measure the performance of the bank, because it is characterized by stability and stability and contributes to directing banks towards the best and correct path. (Al-Moussawi, 2017) Good banking performance may lead to maximizing the value of the bank or economic unit by diagnosing the strengths and weaknesses of its financial performance and rewarding shareholders for their investments, which encourages additional investment and economic growth. On the other hand, poor banking performance may lead to the failure of banks and thus create crises that they have negative repercussions on economic growth. (Crowe, 2020)

## 2. Banking financial performance indicators:

- **return on assets (ROA):** Prepare It is one of the basic measures of the efficiency of banks, as the higher this ratio, it indicates the efficiency of the bank in achieving net profits in the investments of assets. (Kumari, 2011)

The return on assets is calculated (ROA) by dividing the net income of the bank by the value of its assets, and the formula (ROA) is calculated as follows: = net profit after tax / total assets.

- **return on equity (ROE)** It is one of the important financial indicators in assessing profitability. This indicator measures the efficiency of the bank's management in exploiting the bank's own money and the ability of this money to generate profit. It is calculated through the following equation :Net profit after tax/equity. (Geffen, 2012)

**return on deposit (ROE):** This indicator measures the extent of the bank's ability to produce profits from the deposits that it

succeeded in obtaining as it is one of the strategic funds available for employment, and it is one of the most important sources of employment in the bank „Through the following equation :**Net profit after tax / total deposits.** (Seppala, 2010)

- **liquidity indicators** : Prepare One of the most important means by which liquidity management is supported in the bank is to avoid bankruptcy and increase the confidence of depositors in the bank and by working to provide liquidity with the bank so that it can meet the normal and sudden withdrawal movement: (Waad, 2021)

- **Legal Liquidity Ratio: It is calculated by adding reserves primary with secondary reserves/total deposit .**

- **Cash Balance Ratio** :This ratio refers to the sufficiency of quick cash assets to pay deposits, i.e. banks' dependence on liquid assets to cover deposits, and it is calculated by dividing the cash assets by the total deposits.

## Third The practical aspect: the application of banking financial performance indicators to the research sample:

This axis will deal with the applied aspect of the research by banking financial performance indicators on the research sample for the period from (2017-2020 and a statement, its impact on improving banking performance Among the financial performance indicators on which the banking performance evaluation process is based, the most common are the following:

- **return on assets (ROA):** return on assets table For commercial banks sample search For the period (2017-2020)

### Middle East Bank

average	2020	2019	2018	2017	Pointer
0.5%	0.4%	(0.4%)	(0.5%)	2.3%	rate of return on assets

### Ashur International Bank

Average	2020	2019	2018	2017	pointer
2.3%	3%	1.4%	1%	3.5%	rate of return on assets



Gulf Commercial Bank					
Average	2020	2019	2018	2017	pointer
(%1.3 )	7.3% )	0.2%	0.8%	0.9%	rate of return on assets

It is noted from the above table the following details of the study sample banks:

**- 1Middle East Bank** The Middle East Bank recorded an increase in the return on assets for the year 2020 by (4%) compared to the rates of return on assets for the years (2017,2018,2019) as it decreased variably ]((2.3%, (0.5 % ) , ((0.4% [This indicates that the bank's management has tended to increase profits to total assets, and this indicates an improvement in the continuity of the Middle East Bank in the future and improve in its banking performance.

**- 2Ashur International Bank:**

An increase in the return on assets for a year (2017 (by (3.5%) compared to other years, when it amounted to (1%, 1,4%, 3%), respectively, which indicates a decrease in profits resulting from the exploitation of assets compared to the rates of return on assets for the other sample banks, and this indicates a discrepancy in the ability of the bank's management to continue to improve the bank's future performance.

**- 3Gulf Commercial Bank:**

Al Khaleej Commercial Bank recorded an increase in the return on assets for the year (2017(9%) compared to other years, with a gradual decrease in the rate of return on assets for the years)2018,2019,2020(has reached)8%,%2,(7.3( % ) which indicates a decrease in the ratio of profits to assets as a result of the losses achieved by the bank in those years , which indicates the weak ability of the bank 's management to improve banking performance .

From the above, it is clear from this analysis that the Middle East Bank is the best and most efficient in exploiting its assets to generate profits compared to (Ashur International Bank, Khaleeji Commercial Bank), which reflects positively on the confidence of depositors and users of the bank's financial statements in this bank and dealing with it more compared to the sample commercial banks The other study.

**• RETURN ON EQUITY (ROE):**

Schedule return on equity For commercial banks research sample for the period (2017-2020)

Middle East Bank					
average	2020	2019	2018	2017	pointer
1%	1%	(1.1%)	(1.3%)	5.4%	rate of return on equity

  

Ashur International Bank					
Average	2020	2019	2018	2017	pointer
3.6%	5%	2%	1.7%	1.5%	rate of return on equity

  

Gulf Commercial Bank					
Average	2020	2019	2018	2017	pointer
0.7%	(1.3%)	0.3	1.6%	2.2%	rate of return on equity

It is noted from the table (above are the following details of the study sample banks:-

**1Middle East Bank:-**

The Middle East Bank recorded an increase in the return on equity ratio for a



year2017)(compared to return on equity ratios for the years)2018,2019,2020) as it decreased unevenly when it reached]((%1.3, (1.1 %),1 % [respectively, which indicates a decrease in profits to the total shareholders' equity and the occurrence of a loss distributed to shareholders.

**- 2Ashur International Bank:-**

Ashur International recorded an increase in the return on equity by (5%) for the year2020)(compared to return on equity ratios for the years)2017,2018,2019) as I reached1.5% ],1.7%, (%2.)[respectively, which indicates the increase in profits to the total shareholders' equity, and this indicates the improvement of the continuity of Khaleeji Commercial Bank in the future and the improvement of management performance

**3- Khaleeji Commercial Bank:-**

Al Khaleej Commercial Bank recorded an increase in the return on equity ratio (2.2%) for the year2017)(compared to return on equity ratios for the

years)2018,2019,2020(Gradually decreased to reach)1.6 %,0.3%, (%(1.3%)) respectively, which indicates a decrease in profits to the total shareholders' equity, which indicates the weakness of the bank's management in improving its banking performance in the future, and the reason for the decrease in the return on equity was due to economic fluctuations.

From the foregoing, it is clear from this analysis that Ashur International Bank is the best and most efficient in exploiting the rights of its shareholders to generate profits, compared to(Ashur International Bank, Khaleeji Commercial Bank)Which is reflected positively on the confidence of depositors and users of the bank's financial statements in this bank and dealing with it more compared to other commercial banks sample of the study.

• **Deposit rate of return:(ROD)**

Schedule rate of return on deposit(ROD)For commercial banks sample search For the period (2017-2020)

Middle East Bank					
average	2020	2019	2018	2017	pointer
4.7	1.09)	( 0.8 )	1.04	4.7	rate of return on deposit
Ashur International Bank					
9%	13%	4%	2.6%	16%	rate of return on deposit
Gulf Commercial Bank					
1.4	1.6	0.25	( 1.9 )	1.4	rate of return on deposit

**It is noted from the above table the following details of the study sample banks:**

**1Middle East Bank:-**

The Middle East Bank recorded an increase in the return on deposits by (4.7%) for a year2017)(Compared to the return on equity for the years)2018,2019,2020) It decreased variably] (1.09%),( 0.8%)1.04%[respectively indicating no ability Management Bank to generate profits from deposits.

**- 2Ashur International Bank:-**

Ashur International recorded an increase in the return on equity by (5%) for the

year2020)(compared to return on equity ratios for the years)2017,2018,2019) as I reached1.5% ],1.7%, (%2.)[respectively, which indicates the increase in profits to the total shareholders' equity, and this indicates the improvement of the continuity of Khaleeji Commercial Bank in the future and the improvement of management performance

**3- Khaleeji Commercial Bank:-**

Al Khaleej Commercial Bank recorded an increase in the return on equity ratio (2.2%)



for the year 2017) (compared to return on equity ratios for the years 2018, 2019, 2020) (Gradually decreased to reach 1.6%, 0.3%, (% **1.3%**)) respectively, which indicates a decrease in profits to the total shareholders' equity, which indicates the weakness of the bank's management in improving its banking performance in the future, and the reason for the decrease in the return on equity was due to economic fluctuations. From the foregoing, it is clear from this analysis that Ashur International Bank is the best and most efficient in exploiting the rights of its shareholders to generate profits, compared to (Ashur International Bank, Khaleeji Commercial Bank) Which is

reflected positively on the confidence of depositors and users of the bank's financial statements in this bank and dealing with it more compared to other commercial banks sample of the study.

- **liquidity indicators Legal** : This ratio represents a criterion for the ability of the primary and secondary reserves to meet the financial obligations owed by the bank in various circumstances, as the higher the legal liquidity ratio, the higher the bank's liquidity. Systems Economic. Schedule Legal Liquidity Ratio for Commercial Banks Sample search For the period (2017-2020)

**Middle East Bank**

average	2020	2019	2018	2017	pointer
1.5	1.3	1.6	1.6	1.7	Legal Liquidity Ratio

**Ashur International Bank**

average	2020	2019	2018	2017	pointer
6.	12	5.9	5.5	0.7	Legal Liquidity Ratio

**Gulf Bank commercial**

average	2020	2019	2018	2017	pointer
24	8.5	70.9	10.6	6.9	Legal Liquidity Ratio

The Middle East Bank recorded a gradual decrease in the legal liquidity ratio for years (2017, 2018, 2019, 2020) (The search reached (1.7%), 1.6%, 1.6%, 1.3%) respectively, which indicates a decline in monetary assets to total deposits in the last years of the study, but the mentioned ratios for the liquidity of the Middle East Bank are acceptable in all years as they constitute a high ratio that exceeds what is specified by the Central Bank, which indicates the ability of the bank to paying off its urgent debt obligations without the need to sell its fixed assets. As for the users of the bank's financial statements,

they find that this percentage is worthy of giving sufficient confidence to the bank that helps them manage their assets effectively.

- **Ashur International Bank**:- Ashur Bank Register high in Liquidity ratio The Legal as it achieved the highest percentage for a year (2020) in the rate of (12%) Compared to legal liquidity ratios Of Years (2018, 2017, 2019) (The ratios were between rise and fall) (0.7%, 5.5%, 5.9%). Straight Which reflects the ability of management's performance in a positive way to provide reasonable cash liquidity to face



emergency and sudden cases as a result of changes in the banking environment.

**- 3Gulf Commercial Bank** :Al Khaleej Commercial Bank recorded an increase in the liquidity ratio for the year 2019 (compared to percentages of 70.9%) The legal liquidity ratio has decreased for the years 2017, 2018, 2020 (has reached) 6.9 %, 10.6%, 8.5 %) respectively, but the average ratios mentioned for the liquidity of the Khaleeji Commercial Bank are acceptable, as it constitutes a high ratio that exceeds what is specified by the Central Bank, which indicates the

ability of the bank to pay its obligations of urgent debts. From the above, it is clear from this analysis that Al Khaleej Commercial Bank is the best and most efficient in facing its financial obligations and continuity in carrying out its activities compared to (Bank of Baghdad and Ashur International Bank).

- **Cash Balance Ratio**- This ratio indicates that the higher the cash balance ratio, the greater the bank's ability to perform financial obligations on time.

Ratio Table cash balance For commercial banks research sample for the period (2017-2020)

**Bank Middle east**

average	2020	2019	2018	2017	pointer
96.	96.	86	100	101	<b>Cash Balance Ratio</b>

**Ashur International Bank**

average	2020	2019	2018	2017	pointer
328	293	307	212	502	<b>Cash Balance Ratio</b>

**Bank Commercial gulf**

average	2020	2019	2018	2017	pointer
434	328	299	516	592	<b>Cash Balance Ratio</b>

**It is noted from the table (above) the following details of the study sample banks:**

- **Bank Middle East:-** Bank register Middle east rise in Cash Balance Ratio for the year (2017) compared to other liquidity ratios, which amounted to (101), and varied Cash Balance Ratio For the years (2018, 2019, 2020), it reached (212, 307, 293), which indicates The ability of the bank to fulfill its financial obligations on time.
- **Ashur Bank international :** Ashur Bank recorded a rise in Cash Balance Ratio for the year (2017) compared to other years, as it reached (502) as for the rest of the years and varied Cash Balance Ratio

For the years (2018, 2019, 2020), it reached (100, 86, 96), which indicates The ability of the bank to fulfill its financial obligations on time

- **Bank Commercial gulf:-** bank record Commercial gulf high in Cash Balance Ratio for the year (2017) compared to other years, as it reached (592) as for the rest of the years and varied Cash Balance Ratio for the years (2018, 2019, 2020) as he reached (516 ,299 ,328) , which Leads to The ability of the bank to fulfill its financial obligations on time

**Ranking of banks according to indicators Bank financial performance**

Third	Second	the first	Cursor name	T
<b>Gulf Commercial Bank</b>	Middle East Bank	Ashur International Bank	<b>return on assets (ROA)</b>	1





<b>Gulf Commercial Bank</b>	Middle East Bank	Ashur International Bank	return on equity (ROE)	2
<b>Gulf Commercial Bank</b>	Middle East Bank	Ashur International Bank	rate of return on deposit (ROD)	3
<b>Middle East Bank</b>	Ashur International Bank	Gulf Commercial Bank	legal liquidity	4
<b>Middle East Bank</b>	Ashur International Bank	Gulf Commercial Bank	cash balance	5

**FOURTH: CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS:**

**• Conclusions:**

- 1- bank superiority Ashur International in the rate of return on assets (ROA) This gives it an advantage over Al Khaleej Commercial Bank And the Middle East Bank In making a net profit From Asset Investments.
- 2- bank superiority Ashur International in rate return on equity (ROE), which gives it an advantage over Khaleeji Commercial Bank And the Middle East Bank in efficient management in Exploiting the bank's own money and the ability of this money to generate profit.
- 3- Ashur International Bank outperformed in modified return on deposit (ROD) This gives it an advantage over Al Khaleej Commercial Bank And the Middle East Bank in the extent of the bank's ability to produce profits from the deposits that it succeeded in obtaining as one of the strategic funds available for employment.
- 4- Ashur International Bank outperformed in the rate legal liquidity This gives it an advantage over Al Khaleej Commercial Bank The fact that the percentage is very high, which indicates that cash is not used in investment And the It is also preferred over Middle East Bank The legal liquidity ratio is very low.
- 5- Ashur International Bank outperformed in the rate Balance This gives it an advantage over Al Khaleej Commercial Bank The fact that the percentage is very high, which indicates that cash is not used in current and prospective financial investment And also preferred over

Middle East Bank The legal liquidity ratio is very low.

**• Recommendations:**

- 1- The necessity of doing Gulf Commercial Bank And the Middle East Bank In enhancing the rate of return on assets (ROA) , through Achieving net profits from asset investment stranded.
- 2- The necessity for the Gulf Commercial Bank and the Middle East Bank to promote modifier turn on equity (ROE) through Exploiting the bank's own money and the ability of this money to generate profit.
- 3- The necessity for the Gulf Commercial Bank and the Middle East Bank to promote modifier turn on deposit (ROD) By producing profits from the deposits that he succeeded in obtaining as one of the strategic funds available for employment.
- 4- The necessity of establishing the Gulf Commercial Bank and the Middle East Bank in Access to me modified legal liquidity Appropriate and does not affect the generation Profits from investments in current assets.
- 5- The necessity for the Gulf Commercial Bank and the Middle East Bank to reach the appropriate legal liquidity rate that does not affect Not to use cash in current and prospective financial investment.

**REFERENCES:**

- 1- Al-Moussawi, A. A.-D.-J. (2017). "Using the CAMELS model as a tool for measuring banking safety, an analytical study of a



- sample of banks listed on the Iraqi Stock Exchange for the year.
- 2- Bemelmans, V. &. (2017). Auditing and evaluating collaborative government: the. Collaboration in Public Services. Routledge. pp. p. 179-206.
  - 3- Bird, F. &. (2011). Voices From Voluntary Sector: Perspective son Leadership challenges, . *University of Toronto press incorporated.*
  - 4- Crowe, K. (2020). Examination of the Relationship between the Capital Asset Pricing Model's Systematic Risk Indicator and Stock Returns.
  - 5- Fadil Hussein Abbas, A. D. (2020, 10 1). AUDIT COMPLIANCE AND ITS ROLE IN REDUCING THE MANIFESTATIONS OF ADMINISTRATIVE AND FINANCIAL CORRUPTION OF GOVERNMENT INSTITUTIONS (APPLIED RESEARCH IN THE FEDERAL OFFICE OF FINANCIAL SUPERVISION). *PalArch's Journal of Archaeology of Egypt/Egyptology*, pp. 16962-16992.
  - 6- Geffen, M. v. (2012). The Financial Performance and Risk profit of Sustainable firms, . *Master thesis finance & strategic management, Copenhagen business school.*
  - 7- Hanan Abdulameer Kadhim, W. H. (2020). The impact of environmental auditing on the environmental dimension of sustainable development (Applied Research on "Environmental Governmental Institutions in Iraq). *Ilkogretim Online - Elementary Education Onlin*, pp. pp. 2801-2812.
  - 8- Kareem, R. H. (2022, 6). THE ROLE OF THE FEDERAL OFFICE OF FINANCIAL SUPERVISION IN AUDITING INDUSTRIAL ACTIVITY TO ACHIEVE SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT. *World Economics and Finance Bulletin*, pp. 38-48.
  - 9- Kumari, N. (2011). . Balanced scorecard for superior organizational performance. . *European Journal of Business and Management*, , pp. 73-86.
  - 10- Seppala, J. 2. (2010). The Effect of Balanced Scorecard on Strategy Participation, . *Master Thesis Accounting department of accounting and finance, Aalto University, School of Economics.*
  - 11- Waad Hadi Abd, A. D. (2019). Audit Program Proposal for Local Accounts Auditors: Applied Research on a Group of International Auditing Standards. *International Journal of Innovation, Creativity and Change*, pp. 201-221.
  - 12- Waad Hadi Abd, D. A. (2022). THE RELATIONSHIP BETWEEN THE BALANCED SCORECARD AND THE COBIT-5 CRITERION IN IMPROVING BANKING PERFORMANCE, AN APPLIED RESEARCH IN A SAMPLE OF COMMERCIAL BANKS LISTED IN THE IRAQI STOCK EXCHANGE. *World Economics and Finance Bulletin*, pp. 82-91.
  - 13- Waad, H. A.-H.-J. (2021). international auditing standard (520) analytical procedures/applied research on a sample of commercial banks listed in the Iraqi Stock Exchange. *Tikrit Journal of Administration and Economics Sciences.*